



MINUTES OF THE PDWG APPEAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 17 DECEMBER 2020 AT 14:10 UTC VIA ONLINE CONFERENCING SYSTEM

Present:

Mrs Wafa Dahmani	Member
Dr Paulos Nyirenda	Member
Mr Jean-Robert Hountomey	Member
Mr Adam Nelson	Member

Absent:

Mr Luc Missidimbazi	Member
---------------------	--------

Agenda:

1-Welcome & Quorum

2-Last minutes meetings

a. Minutes of 19 November 2020

b. Minutes of 26 November 2020

c-Minutes of 3 December 2020

e.Minutes of 10 December 202

3- Assessment of RPKI appeal

a- PPM video recording review

b- Review of the chat – search and find ‘RPKI’

i. -*1809.txt

ii. -*1609.txt

iii. -*1709chat.Log.txt

c- Review of the RPD mailing list archives during the period of the PPM

d- Review of the co-chair conclusions video

e- Observations and discussion on the materials reviewed

f.- Resolution of the committee

4-Report on the RPKI appeal

5-AOB

BUSINESS OF THE DAY

1. Welcome and Quorum

The Chair WD opened the meeting at 14:06 UTC and welcomed the members present online.

A roll call was carried out to confirm quorum.

The Committee adopted the agenda with amendments.

Agenda Item no 3. was amended as follows;

3- Assessment of RPKI appeal

- a- PPM video recording review
- b- Review of the chat – search and find ‘RPKI’
 - i. 1809.txt
 - ii. 1609.txt
 - iii. 1709chat.Log.txt
- c- Review of the RPD mailing list archives during the period of the PPM
- d- Review of the co-chair conclusions video
- e- Observations and discussion on the materials reviewed
- f.- Resolution of the committee

instead of;

3- Assessment of RPKI appeal

- a-Observations and discussion on the materials reviewed
- b- Resolution of the committee

2. Minutes of the last meeting

- a. Minutes of 19 November 2020**
- b. Minutes of 26 November 2020**
- c. Minutes of 3 December 2020**

The Committee adopted the minutes of 19th November, 26th November and 3rd December 2020.

e. Minutes of 10 December 2020

The Committee agreed to approve the minutes of the 10th December 2020 via the mailing list. The minutes to be amended to reflect the reasons the meeting was adjourned.

3- Assessment of RPKI appeal

a- PPM video recording review

PN commented that the PPM videos showed that there were only 3 speakers on the PPM videos and not enough debate on throughout the video on this policy. Those who spoke were mainly the authors and staff giving the staff report. 4 listed speakers on the queue did not show up even after the co-chairs repeatedly called for them.

There were no further comments from other members.

b- Review of the chat – search and find ‘RPKI’ in chat files with filename:

- i. ***1809.txt**
- ii. ***1609.txt**
- iii. ***1709chat.Log.txt**

The Committee reviewed each chat logs as circulated by the Secretariat and identified all comments with reference to 'RPKI'.

c- Review of the RPD mailing list archives during the period of the PPM

The Committee considered all the discussions that happened on the RPD mailing list on the 16th and 17th September 2020 when the policy was discussed during the PPM. It was noted that community members sent emails during the PPM. There were 29 messages on the subject and with some opposing to the policy, and at least 7 messages from the author to respond to the objections raised.

d- Review of the co-chair conclusions video

The Committee noted that the conclusion of the Co-Chairs was for a non-consensus.

e- Observations and discussion on the materials reviewed

After discussion, PN and AN observed that there was significant opposition on the policy which has led to the non-consensus position.

JR observed that there was consensus. He supported his argument with the fact that the issues raised have been addressed. In addition, JR pointed that the community members who supported the policy have significant experience in operating networks.

WD Was in agreement with JR and noted that during the mail exchanges of the community one's member raised a point that the objections may come from a misunderstanding of some technical issues of the policy she also noted that during the video of the PPM no major objections were raised

PN observed that the community members who raised opposition to the policy during the PPM did give valid reasons for their opposition which indicates that they understood the policy as it applies to the AFRINIC region.

PN pointed out that one of the objections raised was with regards to the fact that the policy is implemented in APNIC, however this does not necessarily mean that the policy is applicable in AFRINIC region.

f.- Resolution of the committee

The Chair proposed to wait for the assessment of LM before the Committee can make a resolution on the appeal. It was agreed that an e-mail should be sent to LM by the chair

and that e-mail should attach the minutes of this meeting so that he can make an informed decision.

The Committee discussed about the attendance of LM to Committee meetings. It was agreed that decisions should be made based on the quorum available on each particular meeting.

4-Report on the RPKI appeal

No discussion held as per Agenda 3 above.

5-AOB

None.

6. Closure

Meeting ended at 15: 08 UTC.