

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE APPEAL COMMITTEE HELD ON FRIDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2018
AT 14:00 UTC VIA ONLINE CONFERENCING SYSTEM**

Present:

Dr Paulos Nyirenda (PN)
Mr Adam Nelson (AN)
Mr Lala Andriamampianina (LA)

Member - Acting Chairman
Member
Member

Apologies:

Mrs Wafa Dahmani (WD)
Mr Ayitey Bulley (AB)

Member
Member

AGENDA

1. Adoption of agenda
2. Minutes of the last meeting of 20 Feb 2018
3. Matters arising
 - a. MINUTE 2: AN to verify and confirm the related publishing dates on the rpd list).
 - b. MINUTE 2: The Committee noted that there is a need to determine whether the last call period is meant to clarify issues and objections during public policy meeting or the last call is a period to note objections raised generally.
 - c. MINUTE 3: Outstanding items for the Committee to consider is about the last call, and whether the Committee is investigating consensus per say or just a process around which consensus was reached by the Co-Chairs. It was agreed to defer the discussion in the next meeting when the full committee's members will be available.
4. Observations on pressure on Co-chairs to approve the policy
5. Opinion on last call –
 - a. PN's view
 - b. L.A. view
 - c. Any other views AN, AB, WD.
 - d. Need to vote on opinion whether Co-chairs erred
6. Schedule on writing the report – volunteers

7. Last meeting to consider the report
8. Publication of the report

BUSINESS OF THE DAY

1. Adoption of agenda
2. Minutes of the last meeting of 20 Feb 2018
3. Matters arising
 - a. MINUTE 2: AN to verify and confirm the related publishing dates on the rpd list.
 - b. MINUTE 2: The Committee noted that there is a need to determine whether the last call period is meant to clarify issues and objections during public policy meeting or the last call is a period to note objections raised generally.
 - c. MINUTE 3: Outstanding items for the Committee to consider is about the last call, and whether the Committee is investigating consensus per say or just a process around which consensus was reached by the Co-Chairs. It was agreed to defer the discussion in the next meeting when the full committee's members will be available.
4. Observations on pressure on Co-chairs to approve the policy

[Minutes not available for Agenda Item No 1. to No 4. Technical issue – no transcript available]

5. Opinion on last call –

a. PN's view

PN's shared his views on the last call as circulated on the mailing list.

The Committee agreed to add a note that the word <has> in Section 3.4.3 of the PDP clearly shows that consensus should be evaluated at the end of the last call period.

b. L.A. view

LA agreed to view as presented by PN.

c. AN view

AN stated that he will like to hear AB's response before making further comments. AN agreed to AB's point of views that the last call points in the PDP that the determination of consensus has been reached at the public policy meeting. The sentence makes two implications in determining consensus; one as to whether consensus has been reached at the public policy meeting and the second as to the determination of whether consensus has been achieved. ???

d. Any other views AB, WD.

AB and WD to share their views. (not in attendance to the present meeting)

e. Need to vote on opinion whether Co-chairs erred

The Committee agreed that there may be the need for the Committee to vote on opinion whether the Co-Chairs erred or not.

6. Schedule on writing the report – volunteers

PN to prepare a draft report and submit to the Chairperson WD for review.

7. Last meeting to consider the report

The Committee agreed to have the following 2 meetings next week to finalise:

- i. Tuesday 27 February 2018 at 14:00 UTC - To finalise discussion, finalise opinions and receive a draft report to be published.
- ii. Friday 2 March 2018 at 14:00 UTC - To finalise the Appeals Committee report for publication.

8. Publication of the report

It is noted that with the timeline published the report is due for next week, by 3 March 2018.

The Committee expressed the view that it would be most appropriate to have full attendance for the last two meetings as proposed above in order to close the work.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 15:00 UTC.