

Appendix B

PDWG Meeting Minutes at AFRINIC-16

Where:

Banjul, The Gambia

Co-Chairs:

Paulos Nyirenda

Timothy McGinnis (aka McTim)

Session Agenda:

17 May 2012		
1700 - 1715	Policy Update & The AFRINIC PDP	Paulos Nyirenda
1715 - 1800	Policy Proposal: Anycast Assignments in the AFRINIC region	Tim McGinnis
18 May 2012		
0900 - 0945	Policy Proposal: No Reverse Unless Assigned	Tim McGinnis
0945 - 1020	Open Policy Mic	Paulos Nyirenda

Session 1: 17 May 2012

Dr Nyirenda welcomed delegates to the first PDWG session and introduced the agenda as previously shared on the RPD mailing list. Notably, he mentioned the introduction of an *'Open Policy Mic'* session scheduled for 18 May 2012 whose purpose is to discuss general policy ideas, a practice ongoing at other RIR public policy meetings.

•Policy Update & The AFRINIC PDP

Mr Nyirenda briefly went through the AFRINIC policy development process and gave an update on recent policy activity. He mentioned the following policy proposals that have recently expired per the PDP:

AFPUB-2011-v4-002-draft-01	Reclamation of Allocated but Un-routed IPv4 Addresses
AFPUB-2011-v4-001-draft-01	Transfer of IPv4 Addresses to Any Entity
AFPUB-2010-GEN-007	Addition of Real Contact Email into ASN Whois Bulk Data

Dr Nyirenda also announced the recent implementation of the **"Abuse Contact Information" policy (AFPUB-2010-GEN-006)** and the publication of **a Best Practices paper** (by AFRINIC) on the implementation and application of this policy. The Best Practices document is available at http://www.AFRINIC.net/docs/Recommended_Best_Practices.pdf

Mr Nyirenda thanked the community for all input and said the PDWG co-chairs will work with the author to revise the proposal with comments received and post it back to the mailing list for further discussions, and for presenting again at the next public policy meeting. He then adjourned the first session of discussions.

Session 2: 18 May 2012

Dr Nyirenda welcomed everyone back to the second day of policy discussions, and invited Mr McGinnis to present the proposal “No RDNS unless assigned”.

•Policy proposal AFPUB-2012-DNS-001-DRAFT-01 : No Reverse Unless Assigned

Mr McGinnis took his PDWG co-chair hat off again in order to present this proposal as the author. He stated that the proposal’s main motivation is to encourage members to enter assignments in the Whois database as it is mandated by policy to do so. He noted that the Whois database is a public network information database, so is supposed to have information about all public networks, so that operators can contact each other in case of any issues.

He stated that members do not register assignments as they should and this is a best practice and that the solution so far is not to not issue an additional allocation till 80% of assignments have been registered. This has a disadvantage that during the time of requesting an additional allocation, assignment information (that should be public) is not publicly unavailable and if LIRs would not need an allocation, this data will never exist.

The author presented data from AFRINIC, showing that more than 60% of ISPs have registered assignments, but at least close to 40% have not registered any single assignment.

Mr McGinnis stated that he is happy to modify the proposal as necessary if the PDWG thinks there are other ways to encourage LIRs to register assignments. He also stated that he is happy to withdraw it if community feels it is not appropriate. The author also briefly discussed the importance of rDNS and the consequences of its non-availability on operational networks.

•Comments

Geert Jan van de Groot expressed doubt that this proposal will work because:

- The internet works without rDNS.
- People that do not know the need to register customer assignments in the Whois db would not know how to do rDNS.

Allan P Barrett indicated that our policies require customer address assignments to be registered in the AFRINIC Whois db – but questioned this proposal’s ability to address or enforce this.

SM, via remote participation, stated that this proposal is good but adds burden to AFRINIC staff. He expressed support but indicated that the proposal may not achieve consensus anyway.

Geert Jan van de Groot asked if it is not in the contract for members to register customer assignments, and that not registering would be in breach and demanded to know what is AFRINIC doing about those not recording assignments, and therefore in breach of the RSA. Ernest Byaruhanga clarified that this is softly enforced when LIRs request for more space, by ensuring that at least 80% of that space is assigned and registered.

Geert Jan van de Groot suggested that AFRINIC investigates the possibility of automating scanning for activity on ports where IP address space is used. Feedback from some members was that port scans need to be authorized by the remote party before they are done.

Mr McGinnis stated he would not like to burden secretariat with the need to scan customer networks, unless someone else is interested in writing a policy for that.

Allan P Barrett stated that consent from network operators and members is required to do port scans, although the consent can be included as part of the AFRINIC Registration Services Agreement (RSA).

There were no more comments from the community and Dr Nyierenda stated that the proposal will be sent back to the list for further discussion, and it will be taken up again at the next public policy meeting, as there seems to be no consensus.

●Open Policy Hour

Dr Nyierenda stated that the Open policy MIC is where the community is invited to brainstorm and openly raise and discuss issues pertinent to policy development and the PDP, the idea being to make this session as open as possible.

He said that topics of discussion need to come from the floor, but some guiding topics were suggested by the co-chairs. These include:

- How to treat global proposals that do not meet approval in other regions, but gets consensus in AFRINIC region. Should the PDP be re-written to address this issue?
- Policies (or their need) for resource revocations.
- Policies for transfer of address space between entities within and outside the AFRINIC service region.
- Proposals that have been posted on the list (which did not meet the PDP deadline for presentation at the face-to-face meeting) - they can be shared by their authors.
 - Regional Internet Registry privacy
 - Whois database cleanup.
- Discussions on IPv4 address trading.
- Co-chair election that NomCom deferred to PDWG the previous day.

Dr Nyierenda opened the floor for general comments, but made a quick announcement.

On the selection of PDWG co-chairs which arose the previous day in the PDPWG co-chair election conducted by NomCom, and which remained still as an issue, Dr Nyierenda said he was a candidate, and that if he was elected, he would step down as PDWG co-chair, which would open up another slot that the PDWG needed to fill.

Mr McGinnis said that it may be necessary to reconvene at the end of the day to select another co-chair if Dr Nyierenda resigned, and thanked him for the transparency.

Jean Robert talked about the Whoisdb cleanup proposal, the main reason being to ensure that each resource has an updated contact information attached to it, and that contact data not linked to any actively registered resources be deleted periodically. Regarding member contact data – Dr Nyierenda asked if there is a way to do automated checks that monitor member email bounces in the Whois db. Ernest said there is something like that ongoing. Leslie Nobile and Louise Flynn stated that ARIN and APNIC have similar initiatives. The general feedback was that the community is willing to support this proposal, as it addresses Whois data integrity. Mr McGinnis also indicated that his “No rDNS unless assigned” proposal shares similar principles, and that he will be willing to combine his proposal with Jean Robert’s if appropriate.

Alan P Barrett thanked PDWG for the open policy hour which enables discussion of ideas that could evolve into proposals, and thanked Paulos for planning to quit PDWG after his election to the AFRINIC board.

Alan then talked about address transfers, stating that business realities will cause transfers to soon start occurring, and since there is no address transfer policy at the moment, there needs something to be done about it. He indicated willingness to draft something if he can get a co-author, and said the ARIN policy is a good candidate to study.

On the selection of a PDWG co-chair (an activity that Nomcom deferred to the PDWG as the community did not have confidence in Dr Afolabi Mabogunje, the candidate presented by Nomcom for this position) Alan P Barrett indicated he is willing to do the job, but would encourage newer faces to take up the mantle. Emile Milandou from Congo Brazaville volunteered to serve.

There was, however, general consensus that there is need for an experienced person should one of the co-chairs be inexperienced. It was then agreed that Dr Nyirenda, who is an experienced candidate, is indeed still the co-chair, but should he resign as a result of his election to the Board, the PDWG would re-convene immediately after the Board election to appoint an experienced co-chair that will complete Mr Nyirenda’s term as per the PDP stipulation.

Mr Milandou was unanimously seconded by the PDWG, by majority show of hands.

Paulos announced Emile as the new PDWG co-chair in replacement for McTim, to serve a 2-year term.

AOB

As a result of Dr Nyirenda’s election to the AFRINIC Board and his immediate resignation as PDWG co-chair, Mr McGinnis reconvened the PDWG meeting on 18 May 2012 1730 UTC+0 after the Board election to select an extra co-chair who would replace Dr Nyirenda and serve the remaining one year of his tenure.

The PDWG unanimously elected Alan P Barrett as the other PDWG Co-Chair, to complete Dr Nyirenda’s remaining 1 year term ending June 2013.